

HARIJAN

(FOUNDED BY MAHATMA GANDHI)

Editor: MAGANBHAI P. DESAI

Vol. XIX. No. 29

AHMEDABAD — SATURDAY, SEPTEMBER 17, 1955

TWO ANNAS

HINDI MEDIUM AND GANDHIJI

(By Maganbhai P. Desai)

A respected friend and co-worker in the Gujarat University once posed a serious question to me. He said, "Maganbhai, can you assure me that Bapu (i.e. Gandhiji) never said that Hindi, the *Rashtra Bhasha*, can be a medium in non-Hindi areas? If I have time, I would myself go through his writings to find out from them if I could have anything to combat the view that one's own language should be the medium and not the all-India common language even." The question was posed to me at the time when the medium resolution was being discussed in the University.

I replied to the friend, "Surely, I have not till now come across anything of the sort you say in any of Bapu's writings. However, I would very much like you to try to find out if there is any to be had."

He said in reply, "I cannot do it, as I have no time nor mind because I have confidence that you will not mislead me by making a false statement."

Thanking him for the confidence I said, "Surely, so far as I know, there is no evidence to show that Bapu would ever agree to having Hindi even in place of Gujarati."

The question of this nature arises in some minds perhaps because whenever the medium question was discussed in the British rule days, it was done vis-a-vis English. The idea of having Hindi was not perhaps envisaged nor so clearly mentioned as at present, though it was always said that the mother-tongue should be the medium. Now some feel that Hindi is one of our languages unlike English which is a foreign one; it is to be the all-India medium; hence, they say, it might be acceptable.

Now this is a wrong conjecture to make regarding Gandhiji's position, which was extremely simple and directly positive: He stood for the entire growth and full development of our languages. That was because he held that this only could ensure the progress of the common man. Denying the full use of his language would inevitably result in inhibiting and obstructing his full growth. Therefore he held that the entire

work of education and administration of a region should be carried on through the language of the people of respective regions.

And for those like my friend above who felt like him about Gandhiji, I quote the following clear statement of his on the point, which he made only a few days before his passing away:

"The redistribution of provinces on a linguistic basis was necessary if provincial languages were to grow to their full height. Hindustani was to be the *lingua franca**—*Rashtra Bhasha*—of India, but it could not take the place of the provincial tongues. It could not be the medium of instruction in the provinces—much less English. Its function was to make them realize their organic relationship with India. The world outside did not know them as Gujaratis, Maharashtritis, Tamilians etc. but only as Indians. We must, therefore, resolutely discourage all fissiparous tendencies and feel and behave as Indians. Subject to this paramount consideration, a linguistic redistribution of provinces should give an impetus to education and trade." (From *Delhi Diary*, p. 379, dated 25-1-48). 3-9-55

* I may note here an observation of Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru which is very apt and pertinent in this connection. He said that all our Indian languages are our national languages; Hindi as defined in Article 351 of the Constitution of India will have the distinction of being used for inter-State and all-India intercourse, as it is known to the largest bulk of our people. Therefore I feel that it could help clarity of thought to say that Hindi is our *lingua franca*, i.e. our *आंतर भाषा* *Antar Bhasha*.

By Mahatma Gandhi

BASIC EDUCATION

Pages viii+114 Price Re. 1-8-0 Postage etc. As. 6

TOWARDS NEW EDUCATION

Pages vi+90 Price Re. 1-4-0 Postage etc. As. 5

By M. S. Patel

THE EDUCATIONAL PHILOSOPHY OF MAHATMA GANDHI

Pages xv+238 Price Rs. 5-8-0 Postage etc. As. 15

NAVAJIVAN PUBLISHING HOUSE
P.O. NAVAJIVAN, AHMEDABAD-14

RANDOM JOTTINGS

(By Maganbhai P. Desai)

There was a plethora of marriages everywhere this year; there was no end of noise by bands, no end of dinners and no end of bustle. School-going children derived a lot of their social education from all this. People spent lakhs of rupees after the gladdening events. Newspaper men described the thousands of marriages and sacred thread ceremonies celebrated in Poona during a day or two as 'marriage-fever'. It is said Jupiter will reside in Leo for the whole of the coming year and hence this hurry and speed.

Even the Parliament among its other jobs gave preference to a consideration of laws regarding Hindu marriage, divorce, inheritance etc. measures, all pertaining to marriage one way or the other. The august assembly too was in a hurry to pass the acts, perhaps on account of the influence of Jupiter!

While these reforms were being discussed on the floor of the House, members of Parliament being mostly of the upper or middle classes had to be reminded that among eighty per cent of the Hindus, divorce and such other customs had their vogue for ages past, by the sanction of the people's will and not of the law. Now people who believe they belong to the higher castes have come out demanding the same reforms for themselves. But they are supposed to be 'civilized', therefore they must have a law for it. It is all to the good, however; for it indicates a march in the direction of equality with the eighty per cent. And could it not also be said that we are undergoing a reform in our old habit of casteism? We can now declare with truth that we have rubbed out by law at least one big distinction which obstinately persisted between the higher and the lower castes.

The law has now ordained a one-man-one-wife and one-wife-one-man marriage system. This is not to mean that you will now have to be content with marriage only once in your life like Sita-Rama. You can have as many marriages as you like even under the law; but now not two wives or more at the same time. Formerly, the Hindus could have as many wives at the same time as they could afford. The Mussalmans can have so even now without any sense of religious wrong about it and the law does not apply to them. The difference for the Hindus will only be that they can have more than one marriage even now, but they will have to follow one after the other. Remember clearly this cannot be called polygamy and women also will now enjoy the same advantage.

And in order to have another marriage you have not to depend helplessly on the God of Death to break up your home by taking one of you away from it; you have now the choice under law to break up your home of your free will! And do not miss the point that you are now

'civilized' or have now advanced by adopting the procedure. And indeed, many there are of our young men and women who prefer the scheme of marriage which allows a breaking up of the home by choice! At the same time one harnesses oneself in marriage the provision for unharnessing is also taken into account. No principle can be truer and more substantial in this age of machines than the one of the safety valve, the principle of providing for an automatic escape before one gets into a scrape. Marriage, it seems, is helping these days the progress of the Vedanta philosophy of viewing with equanimity birth as well as death!

And novel ways are cropping up in modes of marriage also. We are fortunate enough to witness again samples of the ancient modes of matrimony named the *gandharva*, the *rakshasa*, the *pishacha* and various others of the kind. But that is another big chapter which had better be looked into some other time.

In short, a new *smriti* or the law is being forged before your very eyes; but the wonder of it is that it is being done without having any very eminent *smritikara* or law-giver! Like the 'experiments with truth' 'experiments of new life' are also conducted these days. They are, however, confined to those fifteen or twenty per cent of the people who reckon themselves high-born. And God only knows what mentality or thought world these men and women of this small class possess.

Ideal of Married State

The debate in Parliament on the marriage bill gave occasion for a discussion of the ideal of Hindu married life. Marriage is a sacrament, not a contract, it was asserted. A sacrament has education in view—the development of the understanding of life in view. A contract means trading, bargaining. One, therefore, presupposes a religious view of life, the other the prudent and the eminently clever and practical.

For the Hindus the ideal of married couple is Sita-Rama. It is so even today. When homes are broken up by choice by taking recourse to the law of divorce this fact should not be lost sight of. The ideal lays down marriage for life as a religious duty. This ideal marriage is the flower of the various experiments of schemes of marriage tried by the Hindus. If it is lost sight of, Hindu society would cease to look up and ahead. Hindu society is an ancient and aged society. But it is not an old society—it is *sanatana*, eternal. This is because during the various changes due to circumstances it has never forgotten its Rama—God. Let us have any sort of marriage law we like, but its essence lies in the ideal devotion of the ideal example. The devotion could not be had by law—it could be achieved only by a social life devoted to true religion.

Economics of the New Age

Our Minister of Finance seems to have developed a hunger for capital. As it is, the whole

civilized world is shouting 'capital, capital'. Why, every thing has gone capitalist! The farmer produces food, but hankers after cash and is not satisfied with his products of food. It looks as if capital is the food modern man has invented for himself. Some have begun to call it Vitamin M (money).

The Finance Minister feels the hunger for capital on behalf of the whole nation. Could he not find some way to get something out of the huge expenses undergone by the people on occasions of marriages? Registration of marriages has begun under the law. It must have begun to yield a regular flow of fees to Government. But could not the yield be augmented? It is necessary for the marriage season of expensive plans and schemes of development set going by Government and it also is not a small affair. And do we not witness the blind and loud extravagance here also which is usually associated with celebration of marriages?

As the restrictions on number of persons and articles of food for dinners in marriages are lifted, those who enjoy dinners had the best of it. But leave alone dinners, what huge amounts are spent after lighting and other glamorous items! Why, the marriage pandals resemble in many details the *darbars* of Rajas and Maharajas made so familiar by the cinema screen and the men and women who grace them are like so many stars, male and female of the silvery world. The screen seems to set the fashion in dress and ornaments!

But does not all this provoke many new and civilized occupations? The middle class is groaning under the hardships of unemployment. Does it not find easy ways of getting money in this manner?

Some doubting Thomas is sure to say, 'But there is surely a limit to extending the field of these occupations.' True, no doubt. But if the unemployed went on creating such pseudo-employment for themselves in this fashion would it not pay like the play of *maya* to have a huge number of jobs without work? And what after all in essence is the new civilization of the cities?

But where are you going to get the money to maintain these jobs? Now this question shows nothing but ignorance of modern economies. Government mints wealth by printing currency notes; people collect money by cleverness and adulteration, they plan evasion of taxes by the help of the lawyers who are eager to give their intelligence in gift, of course, for consideration; (the sales and the income tax are to be paid under law, it is not something in the way giving alms to earn merit!) Opportunity for black marketing has also not flown away. परस्परं चोरयन्तः भूचिन्मस्राम्यस्य । - pick each other's pockets and help yourselves to make fat money.

Let me however give up satire. We must realize that the ultimate burden of the nation

will have to be borne by the labour of man and his moral behaviour. This is the only true and eternal science of economics. On that solid ground only could the *maya* of the civilized world have its play, on that ground alone could all the pseudo jobs thrive. If the nation were not vigilant enough to see that this burden does not exceed the limit of its real capacity to carry it, the earth will be shaken to the foundation as our Puranas would say. In modern parlance we will be facing a revolution. That too is the eternal law governing human society, for as it has been said of old वसो रक्षति रक्षितः — Dharma protects only when it is itself taken care of. It is the eternal principle safeguarding man and his civilization.

12-7-'55

(From Gujarati)

Wine v. Milk

Reuter in their press message of August 12 from London gives the following noteworthy news:

"British sailors, famous for the quantities of beer they can swallow, are now changing their drink to milk.

British Army and R.A.F. personnel are turning to tea, coffee and lemonade oftener than to a foaming pint.

These "tremendous changes" in military drinking habits are revealed in a new survey conducted by the organization which runs almost all forces' canteens.

Sales in Service canteens 50 years ago were 95 per cent alcohol. Now alcohol is only 5 per cent of the turnover, the survey said.

For the Navy there was an astonishing increase in sales of milk, a survey spokesman said. "It is now tea, coffee and soft drinks for the other two Services."

We learn that in France also conscious efforts by prominent men in her public life are being made to encourage people to resort to milk bars rather than liquor bars.

If these lands which may be well described as the abode of alcoholism begin to change, surely India should hasten to take courage and ban drink and do it immediately. And Governments, after stopping to manufacture and sell liquor etc. to the people, should make further and more intensive efforts to protect the cow and assure larger milk-supply. This will secure not only wealth but health and happiness also. Then shall we realize how true it is that the cow is really the mother of prosperity for us in India.

31-8-'55

M. P.

By Mahatma Gandhi

DRINK, DRUGS & GAMBLING

Pages xi+175 Price Rs. 2-8-0 Postage etc. As. 14

By Bharatan Kumarappa

WHY PROHIBITION

Pages vii + 43 Price As. 12 Postage etc. As. 5

NAVAJIVAN PUBLISHING HOUSE

P.O. NAVAJIVAN, AHMEDABAD-14

HARIJAN

Sept. 17

1955

DOUBTS AND DISINCENTIVES

(By Maganbhai P. Desai)

A press message of August 20, '55, from Sitapur, U.P. says that the U.P.C.C. passed a resolution on the Second Five Year Plan, drawing the attention of the Union Government and the Planning Commission to poverty, growing unemployment, and industrial backwardness of U.P. and urged that heavy industries should be established in the State.

The resolution further stressed the need to promote power projects to electrify the State and provide for growth of heavy industries.

The press report further adds that the resolution also emphasized the role of small-scale industries in the context of unemployment.

On reading this news I felt that here was a patent illustration of the kind of confused thinking that is prevalent at present in our economic thought and planning. It affects nation's endeavour accordingly.

Allied with such resolutions are usually tagged at the end, words calling upon the people to grudge no sacrifices for the success of the Five Year Plan programmes. But all that avails not for the simple reason that the people get no lead from the verbiage of such pious resolutions. If at all, these mean only one thing and that is, that the Union Government should spend crores of rupees in the State for establishing some *heavy* industries. But the latter help the poor people neither this way nor that: they drain away our capital resources without giving sizable employment in return. But the most regrettable result is that self-reliance is not cultivated, as people do not know what they should do and could achieve with their own initiative and due help from Government. This only can really electrify the people and move them to exert themselves for the success of the plan, and not the so-called power projects or similar other things, howsoever big or productive they may be.

This confusion in our economic thinking has stratified itself in our current ideas in the following way. Our thinking and planning is grooved into a pattern of economy called mixed. It consists of two sectors — the State-owned public and the private. The largest and basic part of our economy, viz., agriculture and small-scale village industries, is ignored here. Or, to put it as it is said by some, this is taken to be included in the private sector, although that is generally understood to consist of the large-scale mechanized industries only.

What is called the private sector is glad in one way and sorry in another. That planning will

give place to capital-intensive, i.e. heavy and centralized industries is a good thing as it assures them a place in the new economy. But the capitalists would feel sorry if they are all to be State enterprise. Now, thanks to repeated assertions of responsible ministers of States, they feel assured that it will be a mixed economy. Then they cry for incentives, i.e. in plain words, they desire more scope for profit and lighter taxation etc. A patent illustration of this kind of feeling about the matter is given by a recent utterance of Shri J. R. D. Tata, wherein he told of two things mainly — doubts and disincentives. — Doubts about the common people and their capacity to deliver the goods as we need it at present; and disincentives to the capitalist in his free enterprise.

And he quoted the economic Shastras to show that like a socialistic pattern there is an equally welcome capitalistic pattern also different from the outmoded old capitalism. As he said, "Modern capitalism has changed beyond recognition from what it was a century ago. It has shown a remarkable capacity to fit into the most modern concepts of the Welfare State."

And he said further, "The 19th and early 20th century type of capitalism is indeed just as out of date as the 19th and early 20th type of socialism."

Thank God he did not say that both were almost meeting in a common endeavour to secure a Welfare world! Only the meeting place unfortunately is the battle-ground as typified in the two world blocs!

The Indian ideal is neither capitalistic nor socialistic; it is Sarvodaya. Therefore, the real industrial sector for plenty and prosperity is neither the public or the State sector, nor the private or the Capitalistic sector, but is the third — the massive national sector of the peasant and his small-scale industries. It is these that make for the major production of our needs. If at all any incentive is necessary, it is needed by these and not by the capitalist who, entrenched as he is in power and influence, can easily fend for himself. To cast doubts on these and their capacities is the most pitiable part of some recent pronouncements of economists and industrialists. This bespeaks a danger for the balanced growth of our peaceful and happy economy, the co-ordinates of which are, as I said in a previous issue, agriculture and cattle-breeding buttressed by innumerable household and small-scale industries. What are called heavy industries are just casual in this broad picture. Well may they have their place in it, but not such as to blur the main lines of the picture which is the village economy of an industrious and self-reliant peasantry working in their farms and their homes and hamlets through handicrafts and village industries. The second Five Year Plan, if it is to be a truly people's plan, must base itself on these lines.

VILLAGES v. CITIES

(By Maganbhai P. Desai)

Newspapers inform us that prices of corn, pea-nuts etc. which had gone down to the bottom have again risen twenty-five to fifty per cent. The cause, it is said, is the export policy of the Central Government and non-availability of wagons for transport.

It is good the prices have improved. But it cannot be said to be an unmixed good. The markets of the day and their prices are a cunning gamble. Those who produce priceless raw material do not know much about it, their share of the transaction is only black toil. Others, who carry it from one place to another derive the profits.

What happened is this: The prices went down when traders purchased the raw material from the producer; that is, at the time when the crops were ready to be or were taken. The producer had no financial capacity to resist selling his produce at the time. For centuries, in the state of affairs in India, capitalists who have cash at their disposal have been taking advantage of this helpless position of the producer. The process continues even today.

Is it a constant common annual feature of the situation that now that purchasing of raw materials by traders at bottom prices is over prices are taking a turn for the better? It would not be a matter of surprise if this is found to be true on study and research by an economic expert.

The producer himself as also other consumers will now be compelled to buy the former's produce at higher prices. The difference will go to the pockets of the trader who has cash at his command. He will buy shares, start new concerns of trade and factory plants, and undertake all sorts of ventures from the gain he has made. As a consequence, in short, the process will lead to a destruction further of the already tottering village industries, but to some few it would show large profits and formation of new capital.

Happiness and freedom from misery will not come to the poor man in India till he rubs out of existence this wretched picture. But will he understand? He seems to invite death by running after the mirage of the apparently cheap products of the industrial factories.

Since the above was written I happened to see an article on page one of the *Indian Affairs Record* of June, 1955. It is about the problem of lending and credit in Indian villages. While discussing the co-operative movement the author of the article writes that though many causes are shown for the failure of the movement the real one is different. It is to be found recorded in the report of the All India Village Credit Enquiry. The cause applies, not only, to the state of the co-operative movement, but is so deep and

all-pervading as to affect the entire field of the unfortunate condition of our economic structure. The report states the cause in the following terms:

"In India, as wholly distinguished from other countries, there has been the combination of the following features: (1) a socio-economic structure largely based on caste within the village itself, (2) the linking up of the upper parts of the structure to a cash economy and an administration centralized in the urban sector, and (3) the fact that the linking up took place as the outcome of three processes which historically happened to operate together in India, namely, colonial rule and administration, commercialization of agriculture and urbanization of industry."

After quoting the above the writer states his own conclusion:

"Rural economy after the advent of British power became geared to the demands of a colonial economy wherein in early days the export trade in raw materials, handled from the ports and cities, predominated. Even later when indigenous capital developed, the purpose of the rural economy continued to be the feeding of the demands of urban industries. The mechanism of finance, trade and commerce also developed in consequence an urban bias and was weighted against rural interests. The private credit agencies in the rural areas were linked with the urban financial or commercial interests and were consequently consciously or unconsciously functioning as agents of urban interests in rural areas. The urban-mindedness in such circumstances could not be confined to finance and commerce only but affected officials and even the government. Under such palpably unequal conditions, co-operation could have but little chance of survival."

It is time those who are concerned with determining prices for raw materials produced by the villages began to pay serious attention to the deeply significant fact stated above. A series of agents, middlemen and others of the kind down from the village right up to England was forged in order to draw raw materials from the former, carry them to cities and ports and export them to foreign lands. The tricky machinery of cash finance is very effective in draining away the raw material wealth of the country. The various intervening tricks of the entire game are played in the markets which raise and lower down prices to suit their purpose. It is now the task of the new plan to unravel the strands of the intricate and fraudulent process. In order successfully to achieve the task our economic, trade, administrative and other structures will have to undergo basic changes, because the process described above has deeply influenced all of them. It is as plain as day that economists, administrators and others with a new insight into these things are necessary in order to undo the influence and to rearrange the whole economic set-up which will serve the true interest of India.

14-7-'55

(From Gujarati)

By Mahatma Gandhi

GOAN STRUGGLE FOR FREEDOM

Pages iv + 14 Price As. 4 Postage etc. As. 2

NAVAJIVAN PUBLISHING HOUSE

P.O. NAVAJIVAN, AHMEDABAD - 14

HINDI v. REGIONAL LANGUAGES

(By Maganbhai P. Desai)

The Bombay University Medium Committee is reported to have submitted to the Vice-Chancellor that:

a. Hindi and Hindi alone, i.e. not the regional languages, should be the medium of instruction and examination;

b. The change-over to Hindi from English should be negotiated by 1965;

c. During the transition English will continue; however,

d. So that the change-over may be smooth and possible, Hindi should be begun to be taught in colleges as a compulsory subject.

This means that the University will follow the Macaulay traditions in Swaraj also, by adopting the all-India official language as its medium, which is expected to function in the Union administration by 1965. The one thing for which credit should however go to it is that it realizes the need of teaching Hindi language in colleges as a compulsory subject.

But the above decision leaves the main problem unsolved. We know that the Bombay University set up its Medium Committee when it realized that English could not actually work as the medium, as students were not up to the mark for it in their equipment of the knowledge of English. Now as English is to continue till 1965, this main problem remains unanswered and the decision of the Committee is therefore partial and unhelpful to that extent.

When I say this I am reminded of the Vallabh Vidyapith (Anand) Bill which is before the Bombay Legislature. This also does not take note of this immediate and real problem; and more,—it forthwith enjoins that Hindi shall be the medium to start with! Now it is patently clear that both the students as well as their teachers do not know Hindi and therefore cannot wield the medium of Hindi at present. Sufficient time for the change-over is utterly necessary. It is surprising that the Vallabh Vidyapith Bill does not take note of this aspect of the case.

What should be done then, for this immediate problem? It is absolutely clear that if we desire to remove English—a need which none dare evade, viz., to consider in the interests of sound education and the valid needs and interests of the student world,—then we must immediately begin to teach through the regional languages as the obvious and unavoidable solution of the question, at least till the time students and teachers learn and know their Hindi sufficiently, to be able to ply it as the medium. The time to change over to Hindi will be then and those universities that choose to have Hindi as the medium may well consider the matter at that time. Therefore, to posit Hindi now for replacing English is merely hypothetical and will result either in evading the immediate problem of stu-

dents and perhaps in bypassing the legitimate use of Indian languages as the immediate and handy medium to start with. Hindi is never intended to be the medium of instruction and administration for non-Hindi regions.

The immediate problems before us are very simple and quite obvious:

a. To provide a suitable language immediately for replacing the English medium;

b. To begin to learn and teach Hindi in schools and colleges as a compulsory subject. Their answers are also equally simple and obvious. Let us not misuse the name of the all-India common language Hindi or of English for evading these.

2-9-'55

TUBERCULOSIS AFTER B.C.G. VACCINATION

[The number of well authenticated and thoroughly investigated cases that have recently come to notice as to the adverse effects of the injection of the vaccine Bacillus Calmette-Guerin has called for acknowledgement and comment in the editorial columns of the leading *British Medical Journal*. In an editorial in the issue of April 30, 1955 (reproduced below), the position has been fairly analysed. The fatal cases, it is finally remarked, need not lead to 'alarm'. Where the vaccine is in the hands of experts and the programme is one of controlled and carefully followed up vaccination and not a mass campaign, these untoward results that have been brought to notice need not cause any 'alarm'. But where thousand-fold chances are taken in a mass campaign and vaccination is done under organized official pressure and without adequate or even any form of documentation or suitable machinery for care and 'follow-up', it is certainly a matter for alarm that these well investigated cases show dire possibilities. We respectfully deprecate any facile misinterpretation of the encouraging remarks in the concluding part of the editorial of the *British Medical Journal*. Due notice must be taken of what most reliable authorities on the subject have found, viz. that 'progressive tuberculosis' can certainly occur in previously tuberculin-negative persons who have been recently vaccinated with B.C.G. with apparent success according to accepted standards. The thoroughness of observation and documentation that prevailed in the Scandinavian countries explains the fact that most of these cases came from that part of the world. Unbiased and vigilant watch and scientific observation are wanted wherever this live vaccine is being experimented with. The benefits expected are not in any case much but we should at least steer clear of harm. Where it is proposed to multiply the chances of good or evil a million-fold—as we do when we work it as a mass campaign—caution is all the more necessary.

ED.J

Progressive tuberculosis can certainly occur in previously tuberculin-negative persons who have been recently vaccinated with B.C.G. with apparent success, as judged by tuberculin conversion and sizable vaccination lesions. Sporadic local complications due to the B.C.G. infection, even including regional glandular abscesses (occasionally erroneously diagnosed as due to Koch's bacillus by an observer unaware of the facts), should be excluded from consideration of how such a progressive infection develops; so should disease that follows a natural infection occurring just before vaccination or a few weeks afterwards during the "pre-allergic" phase, and also disease due to reinfection occurring some

years later when protection may be expected to have waned. The following remarks are thus mainly concerned with exogenously caused tuberculosis due to inadequacy of protection, and with progressive lesions apparently due to the B.C.G. itself.

No one now believes that B.C.G. vaccine gives complete protection, and a study of tuberculosis from human or bovine sources in the vaccinated has little statistical meaning unless the number observed is related to the number vaccinated, and unless this proportion is further seen in relation to similar observations on comparable unvaccinated persons. However, even the bare description of tuberculous manifestations in those known to have been recently and successfully vaccinated can provide information on two points—the frequency of different types of case and the time of their onset. When tuberculin sensitivity due to B.C.G. has developed (usually about two months after vaccination), clinical primary tuberculosis is much reduced in frequency, though a primary focus can still result from superinfection.¹ If Dahlstrom and Dif's² figures for 36,000 B.C.G.-vaccinated Swedish soldiers are broken down so as to show tuberculosis with onset between 6 and 12 months after vaccination—when protection might be expected to be maximal—the number of all cases was 39 (but there were 105 at a corresponding time among the 25,000 unvaccinated in their series). Of these 39 cases, 10 were classified as of primary tuberculosis (as against 42 of the 105) and 29 as of post-primary tuberculosis. The primary forms were composed of primary complexes, hilar tuberculosis, and erythema nodosum; while the post-primary cases—following the conceptions in Wallgren's³ "time-table" of tuberculosis—consisted of pleurisy (21), pulmonary tuberculosis (6), and other types (2). There were no cases of meningeal or miliary tuberculosis during this period among the vaccinated (but 11 in the unvaccinated). The prognosis of some forms of tuberculosis—for example, of primary disease and pleurisy, but not of post-primary pulmonary tuberculosis—was better when they occurred in vaccinated than in unvaccinated individuals in this series.⁴ Differentiation between primary and post-primary pulmonary tuberculosis, however, is often difficult and may be of doubtful value.

Simon⁵ obtained somewhat different results, for in a German children's clinic he saw 13 children who developed tuberculosis between 3 and 24 months after apparently satisfactory vaccination accompanied by proved tuberculin conversion. These 13 included 2 cases of hilar adenitis, 1 of pleurisy, 6 of pulmonary tuberculosis (4 with cavitation), 1 of miliary tuberculosis, and 2 of meningeal tuberculosis. Simon concluded that almost all forms of tuberculosis can appear after B.C.G. vaccination, even when immunity can definitely be postulated. The pro-

portion of his cases with pulmonary tuberculosis is higher than in some series; and the occurrence of miliary and meningeal disease is of unusual interest, since, as Ustvedt¹ remarks, although indirect evidence suggests that the frequency of these forms in particular is reduced by B.C.G. vaccination, this has not yet been shown statistically in a convincing way. The clinical onset of meningitis in Simon's two cases was 16 and 24 months after vaccination, and it is therefore unlikely that the children were infected before the effect of vaccination had developed. The author attributes the failures of protection by vaccination to various factors, including constitutional defects, co-existing other infections or metabolic disorders, and, particularly, to massive reinfection. The progress of the tuberculous disease was similar to that expected in unvaccinated children.

As anticipated by Jensen⁶—who pointed out that B.C.G. has the same order of virulence as some strains isolated from natural lupus vulgaris—B.C.G. has been reported, though very rarely, to produce lupus in and around the vaccination site. Marcussen⁷ has reviewed the three previous cases in the literature and added three more of his own; he believes these infections to have been caused by the B.C.G. and not by superinfection from man or milk. A seventh case has since been described by Odegaard,⁸ who suggests that revaccination at the original site of vaccination may be a predisposing factor. Response to treatment is similar to that of natural lupus. Progressive systemic lesions caused by B.C.G. through haematogenous or lymphatic spread have also been reported, again rarely; these include abscess of the knee-joint,⁹ multiple bone lesions with lupus vulgaris,¹⁰ and three fatal cases of generalized B.C.G. tuberculosis.^{11 12 13 14} That most of these more recent cases come from Scandinavia must be ascribed to the large numbers vaccinated there and the thoroughness of observation and documentation. The reason for their occurrence has been speculatively attributed to poor individual resistance—for instance, from transient causes such as measles¹⁰ or from constitutional deficiency.^{11 12} As James¹³ points out, the old fear that the attenuated B.C.G. might regain the virulence of its ancestral bovine strain is not supported, for no ill effect was seen in other children receiving the same batch as did Meyer's^{11 12} patient, and the tubercle bacilli recovered from the latter showed the same low virulence as B.C.G. when tested in guinea-pigs. The production of progressive lesions by B.C.G.

⁶ *Acta tuberc. scand.*, 1936, 10, 83; 1937, 11, 257; 1946, 20, 1.

⁷ *Brit. J. Derm.*, 1954, 66, 121.

⁸ *J. Amer. med. Ass.*, 1954, 155, 61.

⁹ Oster, R., *Ugeskr. Lag.*, 1953, 115, 342.

¹⁰ Imerslund, O., and Jonsen, T., *Acta tuberc. scand.*, 1954, 30, 116.

¹¹ Meyer, J., *Ugeskr. Lag.*, 1953, 115, 1024.

¹² Meyer, J., and Jensen, K. A., *Amer. Rev. Tuberc.*, 1954, 70, 402.

¹³ Thrapp-Meyer, H., et al., *Acta tuberc. scand.*, 1954, 29, 173, 180, 188.

¹⁴ Hollstrom, V. E., and Hard, S., *Acta dermatovenereol. (Stockh.)*, 1953, 33, 150.

¹ Ustvedt, H. J., *Bull. Wld. Hlth. Org.*, 1950, 2, 469.

² *Acta tuberc. scand.*, 1951, Suppl. No. 27. See *British Medical Journal*, 1952, 1, 147.

³ *Tubercle (Lond.)*, 1948, 29, 245.

⁴ Dahlstrom, G., *Acta tuberc. scand.*, 1953, Suppl. No. 32.

⁵ *Arzt. Wschr.*, 1954, 38, 893.

has its experimental counterpart. Thus in silicotic guinea-pigs infected with B.C.G. the organisms were rendered pathogenic and the animals died with silico-tuberculosis, but it is significant that here too the virulence of the B.C.G. when recovered was unaltered.¹⁵ More recently Dubos¹⁷ has shown that experimental B.C.G. infection could become generalized and fatal in mice whose resistance was reduced by dietetic means. The fact that B.C.G. produced tuberculosis can occur in man is clearly of great interest, but the danger is too remote to be alarming. Nevertheless, while apparently rare, these cases are likely to be noted more frequently now that attention has been drawn to their existence.

A.I.C.C. RESOLUTION ON GOA

[The A.I.C.C. in its last Delhi session on September 4, 1955 passed the following resolution on the Goa issue.]

During the last nine years, the Congress has repeatedly expressed its views on the Portuguese possessions in India and pointed out the incongruity of a very small corner of India being under the foreign colonial domination when India herself had achieved freedom. As recently as July 1955 the Working Committee passed a resolution on this subject affirming the right of the people of Goa to freedom and ending a foreign rule in any part of India. The Committee reiterated that the struggle for the freedom of Goa must be carried on through peaceful methods. Further the Committee declared that it was not in favour of any attempts at mass entry into Goa from outside with a view to offering Satyagraha.

Since this resolution was passed, various developments have taken place in these areas, which have naturally moved the Indian people deeply, and the All-India Congress Committee has given careful and anxious consideration to the situation in Goa and other Portuguese possessions in India.

In the struggle for the liberation of Goa, many have suffered banishment and long imprisonment, faced bullets and died in resistance to colonialism. The Committee deplores and condemns the violence and brutality adopted by the Portuguese Government in their attempts to suppress the Goan people and to retain their colonial rule on this part of the Indian mainland.

More recently, on the 15th of August of this year, the Portuguese authorities have fired upon unarmed people and killed numbers of them and inflicted serious injuries on many more. To those who have thus suffered, the Committee pays its tribute and to the families of the dead, it extends its sympathy in their sad, though noble, bereavement.

The A.I.C.C. places on record and proclaims its considered view that the shooting and killing of unarmed men and women by the Portuguese authorities is a violation of international law and a crime and is contrary to the well established practice of civilized Governments.

The Committee has noted with appreciation and sympathy the continued endeavours of the Goan people, in spite of the fierce repression by the Portuguese authorities, to secure their freedom and the liberation of their territories from foreign rule, and conveys to them the goodwill and sympathy of their fellow countrymen in free India.

The A.I.C.C. recalls the unanimous decision of the nations assembled in the first Asian-African Conference at Bandung last April, against colonialism and expresses the confident hope that all the participants in that Conference will support the cause of the liberation of Goa and the

other Portuguese possessions and the people therein and condemn the suppression of their freedom movement and the violence and brutality adopted by the Portuguese Government.

The A.I.C.C. warmly supports the decision of the Government of India to withdraw and withhold co-operation in respect of the Portuguese Government and the other peaceful steps taken by the Government of India in this connection. In particular, the A.I.C.C. appreciates the policy of the Government of India in adhering to and stating without reservation that they will seek a solution of this problem in accordance with their well-known and established principles and approach in regard to all international disputes, namely, those of peace and non-violence. This policy is not only in keeping with the national and international approach of India, but the A.I.C.C. is convinced, is in the best interests of the Goan people themselves and their liberation.

The A.I.C.C. fully appreciates and is in sympathy with the strong feelings that have been aroused all over India in favour of the liberation of these Portuguese possessions in India and against the brutal suppression by the Portuguese authorities of the freedom movement there. The Committee would, however, appeal to the people of India to view this problem in its national and international context and not on any party basis and to support the Government of India's policy in this matter. Any differing and conflicting policies will weaken the national resolve and also the efforts to secure the liberation of Goa.

In their last resolution on Goa, the Working Committee issued a warning against any attempts at mass entry into Goa from outside. This warning was unfortunately not fully heeded. The A.I.C.C. is strongly of opinion that any mass entry into Goa, in the name of Satyagraha or otherwise, is undesirable. The Government of India, after the withdrawal of co-operation from the Portuguese Government have closed and sealed the borders of Portuguese possessions in India and in these circumstances, any entry into Goan territory by Indian nationals will be inappropriate.

The A.I.C.C. is, therefore, of opinion that, in the present context, even individual Satyagraha by Indian nationals should be avoided.

The A.I.C.C. is confident that the people of Goa and Daman and Diu will regain their freedom and Portugal will be compelled to relinquish her authoritarian rule of possessions in India. The Committee sends its greetings to the Goan people and expresses its full sympathy with them in their legitimate and laudable aspirations and efforts for freedom.

The Committee hopes that even at this stage the Portuguese Government will realize that their methods are contrary to the ideas and trends of the modern world and to civilized procedures, and are strongly resented by Asian and all freedom-loving peoples and that they will refrain from further repression and violence and will agree to a peaceful settlement of the problem. The Committee trusts that the Government of India will take every legitimate step consistent with their policy of peace to further the cause of the liberation of Goa and appeals to the people to give full support to this national policy.

CONTENTS	PAGE
HINDI MEDIUM AND	
GANDHIJI ..	Maganbhai P. Desai 225
RANDOM JOTTINGS ..	Maganbhai P. Desai 226
DOUBTS AND DISINCENTIVES ..	Maganbhai P. Desai 228
VILLAGES v. CITIES ..	Maganbhai P. Desai 229
HINDI v. REGIONAL	
LANGUAGES ..	Maganbhai P. Desai 230
TUBERCULOSIS AFTER B.C.G. VACCINATION ..	230
A.I.C.C. RESOLUTION ON GOA ..	232
NOTE:	
WINE v. MILK ..	M. P. 227

¹⁵ Amer. Rev. Tuberc., 1955, 71, 321.

¹⁶ Vorwald, A. J., et al., *ibid.*, 1950, 62, 455.

¹⁷ J. exp. Med., 1955, 101, 59.